

Dallas TX 75234 Phone: 1-800-752-2774

13988 Diplomat Dr. Suite 100

Fax: 214-271-8322

Georgia Kemp

Eddie Lee Howard

April 30, 2014

SUBJECT:

SUSPECT:

Vanessa Potkin

The Innocence Project

40 Worth Street

Suite 701

New York, NY 10013

CELLMARK FORENSICS NO: FR13-0033

AGENCY CASE NO:

2000-0115-CV1H

ADD'L AGENCY NO:

H92-212

### **EXHIBITS**

Client Item	CF Item	Received	Item Description	PCR
H92-212-13-7a	FR13-0033-01.01	3/7/2013	Vaginal Swab Stick	Ň
H92-212-13-7a	FR13-0033-01.02	3/7/2013	Vaginal Swab Stick	И.
Н92-212-13-7ь	FR13-0033-02.01	3/7/2013	Vaginal Smear	Ν.
H92-212-13-7b	FR13-0033-02.02	3/7/2013	Vaginal Smear	N
H92-212-13-6	FR13-0033-03.01	3/7/2013	External Swab Stick	N
H92-212-13-9	FR13-0033-04.01	3/7/2013	Oral/Anal Swab Stick	N
H92-212-19	FR13-0033-05.01	3/7/2013	Knife:Butcher	N
H92-212-20	FR13-0033-06.01	3/7/2013	Box:Kitchen Matches	N
H92-212-15	FR13-0033-07.01	3/7/2013	Knee-High Nylons	N
H92-212-15	FR13-0033-07.02	3/7/2013	Nightgown: White	N
H92-212-14	FR13-0033-08.01	3/7/2013	Fingernail Scrapings:Right Hand	N
H92-212-14	FR13-0033-09.01	3/7/2013	Fingernail Scrapings:Left Hand	Ν.
H92-212-13-6	FR13-0033-11.01	3/7/2013	External Swab	N
H92-212-13-7	FR13-0033-12.01	3/7/2013	Vaginal Swab	N
H92-212-13-7	FR13-0033-12.02	3/7/2013	Vaginal Swab	N
H92-212-13-9	FR13-0033-13.01	3/7/2013	Oral/Anal Swab	N
H92-212-19	FR13-0033-14.01	3/7/2013	Debris:Knife	Ŋ
H92-212-21	FR13-0033-15.01	3/7/2013	Fire Debris:From Living Room	N
H92-212-18	FR13-0033-16.01	3/7/2013	Telephone:Black	N
H92-212-24	FR13-0033-17.01	3/7/2013	Bed Sheet:Bottom	N
H92-212-26	FR13-0033-18.01	3/7/2013	Bed Sheet:Top	N
H92-212-25	FR13-0033-19.01	3/7/2013	House Slipper:Left	N
H92-212-25	FR13-0033-19.02	3/7/2013	House Slipper:Right	N
H92-212-16	NOT EXAMINED	3/7/2013	Brown Paper Bag:Newspaper From Floor Around Victim	N
H92-212-24	NOT EXAMINED	3/7/2013	Large Brown Paper Bag;Bloodstained Bottom Sheet - Victim's Bed	N
H92-212-13-3	NOT EXAMINED	3/7/2013	Pubic Combings Envelope:Georgia Kemp	N
H92-212-13-8	NOT EXAMINED	3/7/2013	Vaginal Wash Envelope:Georgia Kemp	N
H92-212-13-11	NOT EXAMINED	3/7/2013	Blood Sample Envelope:Georgia Kemp	N
H92-212-13-10	NOT EXAMINED	3/7/2013	Saliva Sample Envelope:Georgia Kemp	И

Client Item	CF Item Received	l Item Description	PCR
H92-212-13-4	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/2013	Pulled Pubic Hair Envelope:Georgia Kemp	Ŋ
H92-212-13-5	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/2013	Pulled Head Hair Envelope:Georgia Kemp	N
H92-212-6	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/2013	Wax Paper Fold:Suspect Saliva	N
H92-212-13-8	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/2013	Wax Paper Fold: Vaginal Wash	N
H92-212-13-10	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/2013	Wax Paper Fold:Saliva Sample-Georgia Kemp	N
H92-212-15a-1	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/2013	Wax Paper Fold:T1-Cutting from Nylon Knee High	Ň
H92-212-15b	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/2013	Wax Paper Fold:T1-Cutting from White Nightgown	N
H92-212-15b	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/2013	Wax Paper Fold:T2-Cutting from White Nightgown	N
H92-212-15b	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/2013	Wax Paper Fold:Control-Cutting from White Nightgown	N
H92-212-17	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/2013	Wax Paper Fold:T1-Cutting from Blue Bedspread	, N
H92-212-17	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/2013	Wax Paper Fold:Control-Cutting from Blue Bedspread	N
H92-212-23a	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/2013	Wax Paper Fold:T1-Cutting from Blanket	N
H92-212-23a	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/2013	Wax Paper Fold:Control-Cutting from Blanket	N
H92-212-23b.	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/2013	Wax Paper Fold:T1-Cutting from Blanket	N
H92-212-23b	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/2013	Wax Paper Fold:Control from Blanket	N
H92-212-24f	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/2013	Wax Paper Fold:T1-Cutting from Bottom Sheet	N
H92-212-24f	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/2013	Wax Paper Fold:Control-Cutting from Bottom Sheet	. N
H92-212-24f	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/2013	Wax Paper Fold:T2-Cutting from Bottom Sheet	N
H92-212-25	NOTEXAMINED 3/7/2013	Wax Paper Fold:T2-Cutting from House Slipper	N
H92-212-25	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/2013,	Wax Paper Fold:T3-Cutting from House Slipper	N
H92-212-26	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/2013	Wax Paper Fold:T1-Cutting from Top Bed Sheet	N
H92-212-26	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/2013	Wax Paper Fold:T2-Cutting from Top Bed Sheet	N
H92-212-26	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/2013	Wax Paper Fold:Control-Cutting from Top Bed Sheet	у.
H92-212-9-10	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/2013	Index Card:Blood Sample-Georgia Kemp	N
H92-212-13-11	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/2013	Index Card:Blood Sample-Georgia Kemp	N .
H92-212-7	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/2013	Index Card:Blood Sample-Eddie Lee Howard	N

### SEROLOGY TABLE

Sample No.	Description	Seminal Fluid (Sperm Search)	Seminal Fluid (Prostate- specific Antigen)	Blood (Kastle- Meyer)	Seminal Fluid (Acid Phosphatase)
FR13-0033-01	Vaginal Swab Sticks	Neg	Neg	NT	NT
FR13-0033-03.01	External Swab Stick	Neg	Neg	. NT	NT
FR13-0033-04.01	Oral/Anal Swab Stick	Neg	Neg	NT	NT
FR13-0033-05.01	Knife:Butcher	NT	NT	Pos	··NT
FR13-0033-06.01	Box:Kitchen Matches	NT	NT	Neg	NT
FR13-0033-07.01	Knee-High Nylons	Neg	Neg	Pos	. Neg
FR13-0033-07.02	White Nightgown	Neg	Neg	ŅŦ	Pos
FR13-0033-11.01	External Swab	Neg	Neg	NT	. NT
FR13-0033-12.01	Vaginal Swab	Neg	Neg	NT	NT
FR13-0033-13.01	Oral/Anal Swab	Neg	Neg	NT	NT
FR13-0033-17.01	Bed Sheet:Bottom	Neg	Neg	Pos	Inc
FR13-0033-18.01	Bed Sheet:Top	Neg	Neg	Pos	Inc
FR13-0033-19.01	House Slipper:Left	NT	NT	Neg	NT
FR13-0033-19.02	House Slipper:Right	NT	NT	Pos	NT

Key: Pos = Positive Neg = Negative Inc = Inconclusive NT = Not Tested

### SEROLOGY RESULTS

Presumptive testing for semen was inconclusive on the bottom bed sheet (17.01) due to a late color change. Presumptive testing for semen was inconclusive on the top bed sheet (18.01) due to an atypical color result.

### RESULTS

Human and male specific DNA quantitation using the Quantifiler Human/Quantifiler Y kits, or Quantifiler Duo kit was performed on the samples below. Human DNA was detected; however no male DNA was detected above the system's detection threshold for these samples; therefore, PCR testing was not performed.

- -swabbing of portion of blade in handle of butcher knife (05.01.9)
- -swabbing of outside of box of kitchen matches (06.01.4)
- -swabbing of upper area of knee-high "A" (07.01.56)
- -swabbing of upper area of knee-high "B" (07.01.57)
- -scrapings and swabbings of buttons and button area of white nightgown (07.02.23)
- -scrapings and swabbing of collar area of white nightgown (07.02.26).
- -scrapings and swabbing of inner breast area of white nightgown (07.02.28)

- -scrapings and swabbing of inner right elbow area of white nightgown (07.02.30)
- -scrapings and swabbing of inner left elbow area of white nightgown (07.02.32)
- -swabbing of right hand fingernail scrapings (08.01.1)
- -swabbing of left hand fingernail scrapings (09.01.1)
- -swabbing of debris from knife (14.01.1)
- -swabbings of base of black telephone (16.01.1)
- -swabbings of telephone cord (16.01.3)
- -cutting of KM+ stain on bottom bed sheet (17.01.69)
- -cutting of KM+ stain on bottom bed sheet (17.01.70)
- -cutting of KM+ stain on bottom bed sheet (17.01.71)
- -cutting of KM+ stain on top bed sheet (18.01.56)
- -cutting of KM+ stain on top bed sheet (18.01.57)
- -cutting of KM+ stain on top bed sheet (18.01.58)
- -cutting of KM+ stain on right house slipper (19.02.3)
- -cutting of KM+ stain on right house slipper (19.02.4)

Human and male specific DNA quantitation using the Quantifiler Human and Quantifiler Y kits was performed on the swabbing of the handle of the butcher knife (05.01.10). Neither human nor male DNA was detected above the system's detection threshold for this sample; therefore, PCR testing was not performed.

Human and male specific DNA quantitation using the Quantifiler Human and Quantifiler Y kits was performed on the swabbings of the blade of the butcher knife (05.01.6). Human DNA was detected, and a minimal amount of male DNA was detected. PCR testing may be performed on this sample upon request.

### DISPOSITION

In the absence of specific instruction, evidence will be returned to the submitting agency by Federal Express or another appropriate carrier.

### REVIEW

The results described in this report have been reviewed by the following individuals:

Analyst:

Jennyfer L. Smith / DNA Analyst II

Technical

Reviewer:

Deanna D. Lankford / Associate Laboratory Director

Procedures used in the analysis of this case adhere to the Quality Assurance Standards for Forensic DNA Testing Laboratories. Cellmark Forensics is accredited by the American Society of Crime Laboratory Directors/Laboratory Accreditation Board. The results in this report relate only to the items tested.

cc: Forest Allgood

11th Circuit District Attorney

P.O. Box 220

Jackson, MS 39205

cc: Will McIntosh

Mississippi Innocence Project

P.O. Box 1848

University, MS 38677-1848

cc: Jason L. Davis

Office of the Attorney General

P.O. Box 220

Jackson, MS 39205

cc: Tucker Carrington

Mississippi Innocence Project

P.O. Box 1848

University, MS 38677-1848

April 30, 2014

Cellmark Forensics

'2000-0115-CV1H

FR13-0033



13988 Diplomat Dr. Suite 100 Dallas TX 75234 Phone: 1-800-752-2774 Fax: 214-271-8322

Georgia Kemp

Eddie Lee Howard

August 13, 2014 Supplemental - FR13-0033-A

SUBJECT:

SUSPECT:

Vanessa Potkin

The Innocence Project

40 Worth Street

Suite 701

New York, NY 10013

CELLMARK FORENSICS NO: FR13-0033

AGENCY CASE NO:

2000-0115-CV1H

ADD'L AGENCY NO:

H92-212

### **EXHIBITS**

	·	, .			
	Client Item	CF Item	Received	Item Description	PCR
	H92-212-13-7a	FR13-0033-01.01	3/7/2013	Vaginal Swab Stick	N
	H92-212-13-7a	FR13-0033-01.02	3/7/2013	Vaginal Swab Stick	N .
	H92-212-13-7b	FR13-0033-02.01	3/7/2013	Vaginal Smear	N
	H92-212-13-7b	FR13-0033-02.02	3/7/2013	Vaginal Smear	N
	H92-212-13-6	FR13-0033-03.01	3/7/2013	External Swab Stick	N
	H92-212-13-9	FR13-0033-04.01	3/7/2013	Oral/Anal Swab Stick	N
٠.	H92-212-19	FR13-0033-05.01	3/7/2013	Knife:Butcher	Y
	H92-212-20	FR13-0033-06.01	3/7/2013	Box:Kitchen Matches	Ŋ
	H92-212-15	FR13-0033-07.01	3/7/2013	Knee-High Nylons	'n
	H92-212-15	FR13-0033-07.02	3/7/2013	Nightgown:White	'Ň
	H92-212-14	FR13-0033-08.01	3/7/2013	Fingernail Scrapings:Right Hand	N
	H92-212-14	FR13-0033-09.01	3/7/2013	Fingernail Scrapings:Left Hand	N
,	H92-212-13-6	FR13-0033-11.01	3/7/2013	External Swab	N
•	H92-212-13-7	FR13-0033-12.01	3/7/2013	Vaginal Swab	N .
	H92-212-13-7	FR13-0033-12.02	3/7/2013	Vaginal Swab	N
	H92-212-13-9	FR13-0033-13.01	3/7/2013	Oral/Anal Swab	N
	H92-212-19	FR13-0033-14.01	3/7/2013	Debris:Knife	N
	H92-212-21	FR13-0033-15.01	3/7/2013	Fire Debris:From Living Room	N
	H92-212-18	FR13-0033-16.01	3/7/2013	Telephone:Black	N
	H92-212-24	FR13-0033-17.01	3/7/2013	Bed Sheet:Bottom	N
	H92-212-26	FR13-0033-18.01	3/7/2013	Bed Sheet:Top	N
	H92-212-25	FR13-0033-19.01	3/7/2013	House Slipper:Left	-N
	H92-212-25	FR13-0033-19.02	3/7/2013	House Slipper:Right	N
	2000-0115 CV1H	FR13-0033-20.01	6/17/2014	Buccal Swab - Eddie Lee Howard	Y
	2000-0115-CV1H	FR13-0033-20.02	6/17/2014	Buccal Swab - Eddie Lee Howard	N
	H92-212-16	NOT EXAMINED	3/7/2013	Brown Paper Bag:Newspaper From Floor Around Victim	. И `.
	H92-212-24	NOT EXAMINED	3/7/2013	Large Brown Paper Bag:Bloodstained Bottom Sheet - Victim's Bed	N
	H92-212-13-3	NOT EXAMINED	3/7/2013	Pubic Combings Envelope:Georgia Kemp	N
	H92-212-13-8	NOT EXAMINED	3/7/2013	Vaginal Wash Envelope:Georgia Kemp	N.

Client Item	CF Item Rec	eived Item Description .	PCR
H92-212-13-11	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/2	2013 Blood Sample Envelope:Georgia Kemp	N
H92-212-13-10	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/2		N
H92-212-13-4	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/2		N
H92-212-13-5	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/2		N
H92-212-6	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/2		N
H92-212-13-8	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/2	2013 Wax Paper Fold: Vaginal Wash	'N
H92-212-13-10	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/2	2013 Wax Paper Fold:Saliva Sample-Georgia Kemp	. N.
H92-212-15a-1	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/2		'n
H92-212-15b	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/2		Ν.
H92-212-15b	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/2	013 Wax Paper Fold:T2-Cutting from White Nightgown	N. ·
H92-212-15b	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/2	013 Wax Paper Fold:Control-Cutting from White Nightgown	N
H92-212-17	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/2	013 Wax Paper Fold:T1-Cutting from Blue Bedspread	N ·
H92-212-17	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/20		N
H92-212-23a	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/20	013 Wax Paper Fold:T1-Cutting from Blanket	Ň
H92-212-23a	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/20	1 1 2	N
H92-212-23b	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/20	013 Wax Paper Fold:T1-Cutting from Blanket	N
H92-212-23b	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/20	Wax Paper Fold:Control from Blanket	N
H92-212-24f	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/20	Wax Paper Fold:T1-Cutting from Bottom Sheet	N
H92-212-24f	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/20	Wax Paper Fold:Control-Cutting from Bottom Sheet	N
H92-212-24f	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/20	13 Wax Paper Fold:T2-Cutting from Bottom Sheet	N
H92-212-25	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/20	13 Wax Paper Fold:T2-Cutting from House Slipper	· N
H92-212-25	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/20	13 Wax Paper Fold: T3-Cutting from House Slipper	N
H92-212-26	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/20	Wax Paper Fold: T1-Cutting from Top Bed Sheet	И
H92-212-26	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/20	13 Wax Paper Fold: T2-Cutting from Top Bed Sheet	N
H92-212-26	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/20	13 Wax Paper Fold:Control-Cutting from Top Bed Sheet	. И
H92-212-9-10	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/20:	The state of the s	N
H92-212-13-11	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/201	13 Index Card:Blood Sample-Georgia Kemp	N
H92-212-7	NOT EXAMINED 3/7/201		N
2000-0115-CV1H	NOT EXAMINED 6/17/20	14 Swab Carton:Buccal Swabs - Eddie L. Howard	N

### RESULTS

DNA testing using the polymerase chain reaction (PCR) and the Yfiler<sup>TM</sup> Amplification Kit was performed on exhibits 05.01 and 20.01. The loci tested and the results obtained for each tested sample are listed in Table 2 (see attachment). Due to the paternal inheritance of the Y chromosome, all males from the same male lineage are expected to share the same Y-STR profile.

In addition, DNA testing using the polymerase chain reaction (PCR) and the AmpFlSTR Identifiler<sup>TM</sup> Amplification Kit was performed on exhibit 20.01. The loci tested and the results obtained for each tested sample are listed in Table 1 (see attachment).

This report supplements Cellmark Forensics' Laboratory Report FR13-0033 dated April 30, 2014.

### CONCLUSIONS

### FR13-0033-05.01.6

A partial Y-STR profile was obtained from the swabbings of the blade of the butcher knife. Eddie Lee Howard is excluded as a contributor of the male DNA detected from this sample.

### FR13-0033-20.01.1

A complete STR profile was obtained from Eddie Lee Howard's buccal swab.

### DÍSPOSITION

In the absence of specific instruction, evidence will be returned to the submitting agency by Federal Express or another appropriate carrier.

### REVIEW

Tt 14		41-1	been reviewed by	/1 C. 11	1 . 11 1 1
The resum	s aescribea in	TOIS TEDOM BAVE	neen reviewen hi	/ the tallawing	יפו מווטמזוחחו

Analyst:

Barbara L. Leal / Senior Foreisic DNA Analyst

Technical Reviewer:

Deanna D. Lankford / Associate Laboratory Director

Procedures used in the analysis of this case adhere to the Quality Assurance Standards for Forensic DNA Testing Laboratories. Cellmark Forensics is accredited by the American Society of Crime Laboratory Directors/Laboratory Accreditation Board. The results in this report relate only to the items tested.

cc: Forest Allgood

11th Circuit District Attorney

P.O. Box 220

Jackson, MS 39205

cc: Will McIntosh

Mississippi Innocence Project

P.O. Box 1848

University, MS 38677-1848

cc: Jason L. Davis

Office of the Attorney General

P.O. Box 220

Jackson, MS 39205

cc: Tucker Carrington

Mississippi Innocence Project

P.O. Box 1848

University, MS 38677-1848



13988 Diplomat Dr. Suite 100 Dallas TX 75234 Phone: 1-800-752-2774

8/13/2014

Supplemental - FR13-0033-A

CELLMARK FORENSICS NO: FR13-0033 2000-0115-CV1H

Identifiler,

Table 1

ADD'L AGENCY NO: AGENCY CASE NO:

H92-212

$X, Y \neq Malc$		FR13-0033-20.01.1 2000-0115-CV1H	Eddle Lee Howard	Sample Name	7
			14, 16	D8S1179	
			28	D21S11	
		•	7, 10	D7S820	
			11	CSF1PO	
			16	D3S1358	
-		<u>.</u>	6.7	. TH01	•
		. i	3	: D13S317	
	``	, 10, 12	10 13	D16S539	
			17:10	D2S1338	
		13, 14		D19S433	
	- ,	16		vWA	
		10		TPOX	
		15, 16		D18S51	
		ΧX		AMEL	
		. 13		D5S818	

21, 22

FGA

The results listed in the table do not depict intensity differences. Only alleles exceeding validated analysis threshold are included in table.



13988 Diplomat Dr. Suite 100 Dallas TX 75234 Phone: 1-800-752-2774 Fax: 214-271-8322

8/13/2014

Supplemental - FR13-0033-A

Table 2

ADD'L AGENCY NO: AGENCY CASE NO:

CELLMARK FORENSICS NO: FR13-0033

2000-0115-CV1H

H92-212

Sample Name			
	DYS456	DYS389I	DYS390
Knife:Butcher (Blade)			
FR13-0033-05.01.6			23
H92-212-19			
Eddie Lee Howard	,		
FR13-0033-20.01.1	ć	4	22
2000-0115-CV1H			
XY=Mois			
= Possible additional allele(s) below threshold	w threshold	-	

بب

9

17

15, 18

ü

10

12

B

ŏ

14

21

K

18

Z

13

X

X

NR

Z

N.

DYS389II

DYS458

DYS19

DYS385a/b

DYS393

DYS391

DYS439

DYS635

DYS392

N GATA H4

DYS437

**DYS438** 

DYS448

NR = No Result

The results listed in the table do not depict intensity differences. Only alleles exceeding validated analysis threshold are included in table.

					•
		٠.			-
					. ;
					_